

MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE COUNCIL HELD IN COUNCIL CHAMBER - CITY HALL, BRADFORD ON TUESDAY, 14 MARCH 2023

Commenced 4.00 pm
Concluded 8.05 pm

PRESENT

Councillors:

LABOUR

A Ahmed	Alipoor	Amran	Azam
Berry	Choudhry	Cunningham	Dearden
Dodds	Duffy	Engel	Ferriby
Firth	Godwin	D Green	Hayden
Hinchcliffe	Humphreys	A Hussain	I Hussain
K Hussain	M Hussain	S Hussain	T Hussain
Iqbal	Jabar	Jamil	Johnson
H Khan	I Khan	S Khan	Lal
Lee	Lintern	Mullaney	Nazir
Regan	Ross-Shaw	Rowe	Shafiq
Shaheen	Slater	Tait	Thirkill
Thornton	Walsh	Wheatley	Wood

CONSERVATIVE

F Ahmed	Birch	Brown	P Clarke
Coates	Davies	Felstead	Glentworth
Goodall	Loy	Pollard	Poulsen
Smith	Sullivan	Winnard	

LIBERAL DEMOCRAT

R Ahmed	Griffiths	Knox	Naylor
Sunderland			

GREEN

Edwards	Hickson	Warnes	Watson
Whitaker			

BRADFORD INDEPENDENTS

Elahi
Sajawal

BRADFORD SOUTH INDEPENDENTS

Majkowski

ILKLEY INDEPENDENT

Hawkesworth

The Lord Mayor, Councillor Love in the Chair

75. DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

Minute no. 86 – Notices of Motion (Support for Care Experienced People)

Councillor Sunderland disclosed a non-pecuniary interest in the interests of openness and transparency in her role as a Corporate Parent.

Minute no. 86 – Notices of Motion (Defend the right of refugees to seek safety from war and persecution)

Councillor Firth disclosed a non-pecuniary interest in the interests of openness and transparency in her capacity as a member of Keighley Place of Sanctuary.

Councillor Lal disclosed a non-pecuniary interest in the interests of openness and transparency due to her employment as an immigration specialist at the Bradford Law Centre.

Minute no. 86 – Notices of Motion (Young Carers)

Councillor Sunderland disclosed a non-pecuniary interest in the interests of openness and transparency in her role as Trustee of a Children's Charity.

Minute no. 86 – Notices of Motion (Support for services for young people in the Bradford District)

Councillor Sunderland disclosed a non-pecuniary interest in the interests of openness and transparency in her role as Trustee of a Children's Charity.

76. MINUTES

Resolved – That the minutes of the Council meeting held on 23 February 2023 be signed as a correct record.

77. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Ali, Akhtar, Barker, Joan Clarke, Kyle Green, Herd, Mohammed, Mukhtar, Nazam, Salam and Stubbs.

An apology for lateness was received from Councillor Mohsin Hussain.

78. WRITTEN ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM THE LORD MAYOR (Standing Order 4)

A copy of the Lord Mayor's announcements had been circulated and published on the Council's website.

79. INSPECTION OF REPORTS AND BACKGROUND PAPERS

There were no restricted items.

80. PETITIONS (Standing Order 11)

There were no petitions to consider.

81. PUBLIC QUESTION TIME (Standing Order 13)

There were no public questions to consider.

82. MEMBERSHIP OF COMMITTEES AND JOINT COMMITTEES (Standing Order 4)

That the following membership changes be approved:

Resolved – Following his appointment at the Local Councils' Liaison Group meeting on Tuesday, 28 February 2023, that Town Councillor James Roberts be appointed as a non-voting co-opted member on Standards Committee for the remainder of the 2022/23 municipal year. Town Councillor James Roberts replaces Parish Councillor Caroline Whitaker who stepped down from the role having been elected as a District Councillor at the 2022 Local Elections.

83. REPORT BY THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL

The report of the Leader of the Council had been circulated and published on the Council's website.

84. MEMBER QUESTION TIME (Standing Order 12)

Details of the questions from Members to the Leader of Council and Portfolio Holders and the answers given had been circulated and published on the Council's website.

85. RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE EXECUTIVE AND COMMITTEES (Standing Order 15)

There were no recommendations from the Executive and Committees to consider.

86. NOTICES OF MOTION (Standing Order 17)

Resolved – That the following notices of motion be approved:

12.1 – Support for Care Experienced People

Moved by: Councillor Sue Duffy

Seconded by: Councillor Susan Hinchcliffe

That with the addition and deletion of the appropriate words, the motion be amended to read as follows:

This Council notes:

The [Independent Review of Children’s Social Care headed by Josh MacAlister](#) published in May 2022 had a final report and recommendations that included:

“Government should make care experience a protected characteristic” and “New legislation should be passed which broadens corporate parenting responsibilities across a wider set of public bodies and organisations.”

In Bradford we have a Care Leaver Local Offer co-produced with care leavers and we offer support for care leavers such as:

- Exemption from council tax to the age of 25, which includes our young people moving to other local authority areas
- Priority for social housing to the age of 21
- Support towards the costs of setting up a home
- Support towards the costs of travel to work or training
- Free access to leisure facilities to the age of 25 as part of our local offer
- Joint housing protocol
- Ringfenced apprenticeship opportunities for care leavers within the council
- Mentoring opportunities for care leavers with the council’s senior leadership team
- A children in care and care leavers council.

Ofsted carried out a full ILACS inspection in Bradford between 21st November and 2nd December 2022. The report was published on the Ofsted website on 31st January 2023 and the outcome of the ILACS was the judgement of Inadequate in all areas and overall.

The Council has welcomed the new Bradford Children’s and Families Trust, which is on track to start on 1st April, as part of the plan to deliver the urgent and sustained improvements that are required.

We are continually looking at how we can build on our progress to improve the

experience and opportunities for care experienced people in our district.

This Council further notes:

Despite the challenges they face, with the right support care experienced people can fulfil their potential to live full and rewarding lives;

Care experienced people face significant barriers that can impact them throughout their lives;

Despite the resilience of many care experienced people, society too often does not take their needs into account;

Care experienced people can often face discrimination and stigma across housing, health, education, relationships, employment and in the criminal justice system;

Care experienced people might encounter inconsistent support in different geographical areas;

As corporate parents, councillors have a collective responsibility for providing the best possible care and safeguarding for the children who are looked after by us as an authority;

All corporate parents should commit to acting as mentors, hearing the voices of looked after children and young people and to consider their needs in any aspect of council work;

Councillors should be champions of the children in our care and challenge the negative attitudes and prejudice that exists in all aspects of society;

The Public Sector Equality Duty requires public bodies, such as councils, to eliminate unlawful discrimination, harassment, and victimisation of people with protected characteristics.

This Council therefore resolves:

1. To recognise care experienced people are a group who are likely to face discrimination;
2. To recognise that Councils have a duty to put the needs of disadvantaged people at the heart of decision-making through co-production and collaboration;
3. To instruct the Chief Executive of the Council to ensure that future decision, services and policies made and adopted by the Council should

be assessed through Equality Impact Assessments to determine the impact of changes on people with care experience, alongside those who formally share a protected characteristic;

4. To call upon the Chief Executive of the Children's Trust to ensure that future decisions, services and policies made and adopted by the Children's Trust should be assessed through Equality Impact Assessments to determine the impact of changes on people with care experience, alongside those who formally share a protected characteristic.
5. To ensure in the delivery of the Public Sector Equality Duty the Council includes care experience in the publication and review of Equality Objectives and the annual publication of information relating to people who share a protected characteristic in services and employment, and call upon the Children's Trust to do the same.
6. To treat care experience as if it were a Protected Characteristic.
7. To formally call upon all other bodies, including those across West Yorkshire who are partners to the Care Covenant, to treat care experience as a protected characteristic until such time as it may be introduced by legislation.
8. To proactively seek out and listen to the voices of care experienced people when developing new policies based on their views.

12.2 – Defend the right to seek safety from war and persecution

Moved by: Councillor Kevin Warnes

Seconded by: Councillor Matt Edwards

That the motion be amended to read as follows:

Council notes that:

- Bradford is proud of our history of welcoming people seeking safety to our district as a City of Sanctuary;
- there are significant problems with the UK asylum system that affect people in Bradford, including a record backlog of cases awaiting a decision, a de facto ban on working, and enforced poverty and homelessness - problems that undermine people's ability to rebuild their lives;
- the backlog in processing asylum cases means that vulnerable adults and children are housed in hotels and other accommodation which is completely inappropriate for long term habitation;
- the government is failing to work with local councils or local partners who are able to provide support for asylum seekers, exposing them to risks from criminal gangs;

- the Nationality and Borders Act 2022 does not address these issues;
- the Act has created a two-tier system that punishes people seeking safety from war and persecution based on the journeys they make;
- the Act threatens them with removal to Rwanda where they will be warehoused in large accommodation centres, segregated from the wider community and denied support;
- the Act also leaves recognised refugees to the UK - some of the most vulnerable people in the world - with a temporary and precarious status.

Council further notes that:

- each claim for asylum should be treated equally and fairly;
- people seeking safety should be housed as our neighbours and as a part of our communities;
- the UK needs an asylum system that empowers people seeking safety to rebuild their lives and enables communities to welcome them;
- 400+ charities, faith groups and local authorities have signed Refugee Action's national pledge to 'Fight the 'Anti-Refugee Laws', including Bradford City of Sanctuary;
- the government's Illegal Immigration Bill, now progressing through its legislative stages in the House of Commons, will (a) not solve the problems referred to above and (b) places the UK in further jeopardy of breaching its international legal obligations.

Council therefore resolves to:

- 1) defend the right to seek safety from war and persecution in the UK and sign Refugee Action's national 'Fight the Anti-Refugee Laws' pledge;
- 2) call on the UK Government to withdraw the UK-Rwanda agreement, repeal the Nationality and Borders Act and withdraw the Illegal Immigration Bill from further consideration by Parliament;
- 3) work with Local Authorities and communities to build a refugee protection system that treats all people with dignity and compassion;
- 4) work with local organisations and people with lived experience of the asylum system to identify ways to mitigate the effects of these measures in Bradford.

12.3 – A critical time for our water environment

Moved by: Councillor Celia Hickson

Seconded by: Councillor Caroline Whitaker

Council notes that:

- A deluge of untreated sewage is being discharged into our rivers through

storm overflows, polluting over 80% of watercourses nationally.

- Figures from campaign group 'Top of the Poops' have shown that raw sewage was pumped into the River Aire 4,085 sewage times in 2021 - the highest number of any river in Great Britain.
- Across the area covered by Yorkshire Water, over 2000 storm overflows have recorded on average 33 incidents a year, with raw sewage flowing into watercourses for on average 6h per incident, which equates to 396,000 hours of untreated human effluent flowing straight into our environment.
- Whilst event duration management (EDM) data from the Environment Agency does show a reduction in average 'spills' year on year, this decrease is not happening with the urgency required to clean up these non-accidental events.
- Closure of swimming pools during lockdown led to a surge of people enjoying wild swimming, focusing national attention on the water quality of rivers and highlighted the human health risks associated with exposure to sewage pollution.
- No-one would accept sewage pollution of football pitches or basketball courts but Government and Water Companies deem it acceptable to pollute the water playground of millions every day.
- The designated bathing spot at the River Wharfe at Cromwheel in Ilkley has continued to be monitored as 'poor' with faecal bacteria contamination showing in every sample taken and being measured at maximum contamination levels on 3 occasions last summer.
- Government is not facing up to the scale of this environmental scandal which is destroying ecosystems, contaminating food sources and posing a serious health hazard to people using our rivers for recreation.
- The Government has published the woefully inadequate Storm Overflows Discharge Reduction Plan which gives water companies another 27 years to improve or reduce discharge incidents, effectively green lighting environmental damage for decades.

Council also notes that:

- 256 MPs - including the Conservative MP for Keighley - voted against a Lords amendment to the Environment Act which would have placed a legal duty on water companies to make demonstrable improvements in their sewerage systems.
- Local voluntary groups and charities, such as ART (Aire Rivers Trust) and Yorkshire Dales Rivers Trust are working hard to improve the condition of

our rivers.

Council resolves to request that the Chief Executive of the Council:

- engages with Yorkshire Water, as a local custodian of our natural environment, and solicits regular updates on storm overflow data for our District.
- writes to all local MPs to stand up for local residents to strongly argue for much tougher regulation of Water Company failures.
- Urge the newly formed Office for Environmental Protection and the Government to use the measures previously placed on Water Companies to clean up coastal waters to do the same for our neglected rivers with a Strategic Policy Statement detailing explicit, objective measures of success in a vastly reduced time frame.

12.4 – Children’s Services

Moved by: Councillor Susan Hinchcliffe

Seconded by: Councillor Sue Duffy

That with the addition and deletion of the appropriate words, the motion be amended to read as follows:

Council notes:

In September 2018 Ofsted found this Council’s Children’s Services to be inadequate and since that inspection, seven further monitoring visits have been carried out with concerns repeatedly raised about the slow pace of change.

Ofsted carried out a full ILACS inspection in Bradford between 21st November and 2nd December 2022. The report was published on the Ofsted website on 31st January 2023 and the outcome of the ILACS was the judgement of Inadequate in all areas and overall.

Record funding will be given to support Children’s Services within the new Bradford Children’s and Families Trust.

Councillors will continue to take their corporate parenting responsibilities seriously. Improving services for children is a challenge for us all and depends on effective partnership working with other agencies in the district as well as a constructive partnership between the council and Trust.

The dedication of staff within Children’s services who go above and beyond in their care and support for children and young people. Our staff are key to securing the necessary improvements for the children of the district.

The role of Children’s Overview & Scrutiny within the council’s constitution will not

change as the committee continues to fulfil its important remit of scrutinising and holding to account the Bradford Children's and Families Trust and wider children's services.

The Council Chief Executive has begun a review of the council's management structure to ensure it is best able to provide strong support to the Children's Services team and to ensure that the Council is able to provide the required strong support and challenge for the Trust.

Council resolves:

- To welcome the formation of the Bradford Children's and Families Trust.
- To call on all Partners across the District to support the work of the Bradford Children's and Families Trust.
- To support the Children's Commissioner, as Chair of the Improvement Board, to continue his work in monitoring the implementation of the Children's Improvement Plan
- To make sure Councillors are regularly updated on progress of the Trust and the Improvement Plan.
- To instruct the Chief Executive to complete the review of the council's management structure at pace.

12.5 – Young Carers

Moved by: Councillor Sue Duffy

Seconded by: Councillor Susan Hinchcliffe

That with the addition and deletion of the appropriate words, the motion be amended to read as follows:

Council notes:

- Each year Carers Trust organises Young Carers Action Day (YCAD) to raise public awareness of the challenges faced by young people because of their caring role, and to campaign for greater support for young and young adult carers to meet their needs.
- Young Carers Action Day is 15 March 2023 and this year's theme is 'Make Time for Young Carers'.
- Estimates suggest that as many as one in five schoolchildren could be young carers (University of Nottingham 2018), with this number increasing during the COVID-19 pandemic.
- Caring for someone can be very isolating, worrying, and stressful. For young and young adult carers, this can negatively impact on their experiences and outcomes in education, having a lasting effect on their life chances.

- The Young Carers Service is a jointly commissioned service between the Council and NHS West Yorkshire (ICS) Bradford.
- Carers' Resource is commissioned to offer support to carers of all ages in the Bradford district. They work with around 800 young carers aged 5-18 and offer specific support to Young Adult Carers aged 16-25 as they transition to adulthood. The service is designed to increase young carers' well-being and resilience, to help them achieve their potential as successful, happy adults.
- The support for young carers includes respite and peer support through school holiday trips and activities at eight youth clubs around the district. One-to-one support is also offered at times of crisis.
- The theme for YCAD this year is 'Make Time for Young Carers'. As a network partner of Carers Trust, Carers' Resource successfully applied for a grant from them to arrange a treasure hunt task to mark the event, with young carers challenged and supported to use public transport to find their way to a district location with the aim of boosting their confidence and tackling social isolation in a fun way, with the young carers also given travel tickets for a journey in future to encourage them to continue getting out on public transport.

Council resolves:

- To commend the young and young adult carers across our Local Authority area.
- To promote YCAD on an annual basis.
- To continue to promote and work with local care organisations.
- To write to the Government calling on them to urgently publish a national strategy for unpaid carers in 2023 and to develop a national action plan co-produced with young carers and young adult carers, in line with the recommendation of the Carers Trust.
- To write to the local Members of Parliament and ask them to join the All-Party Parliamentary Group (APPG) for Young Carers and Young Adult Carers.

12.6 – Bradford District and the Chancellor's Budget

Moved by: Councillor Susan Hinchcliffe

Seconded by Councillor Imran Khan

Council notes:

- The government's Spring Budget is announced on 15th March 2023.
- The Leader has written to the Chancellor to set out our district's unrivalled case for investment to achieve levelling up ambitions, as well as the urgent

need for central government to address the systemic underfunding of local services by providing new, sustainable and fair funding.

- Bradford has enterprising, globally connected businesses and strong public and voluntary sector partnerships serving urban and rural communities. We are the UK's youngest city and among its most diverse.
- Bradford will be UK City of Culture 2025 and we are progressing an ambitious pipeline of projects to help unleash the district's potential as a national leader on clean growth.
- We remain ambitious for the future success of the place despite the challenges we face. Since government austerity began in 2010 the council has had to find cuts, savings and income equating to approximately £2.5bn.
- An unprecedented cost of living crisis for our residents which has resulted in inflation running at 10% and food costs up 17%.
- Council workers are public service super-heroes. They keep our communities clean and safe, look after those in need and keep our towns and city running. These are the key workers who during the pandemic were thanked by the public with weekly applause for going above and beyond to help others.
- Since 2010 public sector staff have endured years of pay restraint due to government austerity. It is time government funded the pay of local government staff properly bringing them into line with other public sector workers and with the private sector which will also help recruitment challenges.

Council endorses the Leader's call for Government to:

- Properly tackle the cost of living crisis for residents and businesses.
- Support people in the face of excessive bills; working with councils on new energy sources; and turbo charging a nationwide insulation programme.
- Strengthen national commitments to levelling up, by delivering funding for a new Bradford city centre through-station on Northern Powerhouse Rail.
- Deliver Government investment to help maximise the benefits and impact of UK City of Culture 2025.
- Reform levelling up funding – Government funding for regeneration should be awarded on evidence of need and impact not through “beauty contests”.
- Deliver overdue financial reforms to reflect local needs and resources – independent analysis demonstrates Bradford would benefit by £32m a year from the proposed Fair Funding Review and business rate reforms.
- Provide sufficient funding to meet demand and complexity in Children's and Adult Social Care and address what the Market and Competitions

Authority called a dysfunctional market for children's residential care with private sector profiteering.

- Enhance support for West Yorkshire devolution and priorities, including commitment to Northern Powerhouse Rail, regional mass transit and full devolution of adult employment, skills and careers funding.

Council resolves

To call on all our district's MPs, regardless of political affiliation, to speak up for residents and challenge government to provide new, fair and sustainable funding for the council services people rely on.

On the need for a pay increase for local government workers to be fully funded with new money from central government, that the Council Leader will write to the Chancellor and Secretary of State to make that case as part of a new, fair and sustainable funding package for local authorities.

12.7 – Support for services for young people in the Bradford District

Moved by: Councillor Susan Hinchcliffe

Seconded by: Councillor Abdul Jabar

Bradford is the youngest city in the country with nearly 34% of our residents under the age of 25. Where many councils up and down the country have cut their Youth Service completely, Bradford Council has sustained this valuable service. Today the Youth Service runs 90 sessions every week serving 1,400 young people a week from every ward in the district. They do this with just 30 full-time workers and 100 part-time workers.

Our voluntary sector provides a complementary rich and diverse offering for young people in the district. There are 150 voluntary sector organisations supported by Young Lives.

The Council notes:

- Our thanks for our young people who were great ambassadors for the Bradford district becoming City of Culture. Without them we would not have won.
- Our thanks to the Young Covid Ambassadors who were the eyes and ears for the council and our partners during Covid, making sure that our messages and support for young people was meaningful.
- The invaluable work that our Youth Workers do for the Youth in Mind work, buddying with young people who may have mental health issues. 130 referrals a month are made to the service from schools alone.

The Council resolves:

- To ask Government to devolve the National Citizenship Service to local

level. Working within a national framework councils are better sighted on the young people in their area and can make sure the local offer engages our young people.

- To ensure that the City of Culture volunteering programme properly involves young people. We want City of Culture volunteering to be something they remember positively for the rest of their lives.
- To push locally and nationally for the NHS to provide more timely, better funded mental health support for young people. This should be reflected in their funding priorities.
- To profile the positive contribution that our young people make day in day out all across the district.

Lord Mayor

Note: These minutes are subject to approval as a correct record at the next meeting of the Council.

THESE MINUTES HAVE BEEN PRODUCED, WHEREVER POSSIBLE, ON RECYCLED PAPER